

174707 - Will the one who does Hajj or 'Umrah on behalf of another person have the same reward?

the question

Allah blessed me and enabled me to do 'umrah twice this year. The first was in Sha'baan and the second was in Ramadan. But the second time I did it on behalf of my deceased father. Will the reward of 'umrah in Ramadan be recorded for me?

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

The scholars (may Allah have mercy on them) differed as to whether the one who does Hajj or 'Umrah on behalf of another person will have the same reward as the one on whose behalf it is done. There are two views:

-1-

The first view is that the proxy will have a reward like that of the one on whose behalf he does it, so both of them are included in the virtue mentioned in the words of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him): "Whoever performs Hajj and does not commit any obscenity or commit any evil will go back (free of) sin as on the day his mother bore him" and " 'Umrah during it - i.e., Ramadan - is equivalent to Hajj."

Those who held this view quoted as evidence the general meaning of the hadeeths quoted above. They also noted that if "the one who tells others of some good deed will have a reward like that of the one who does it," as is mentioned in the saheeh hadeeth from the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him), then it is more appropriate that the one who does an action on behalf

Islam Question & Answer

General Supervisor:

Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid

of someone else should also receive the reward in full.

Ibn Hazm (may Allah have mercy on him) said: It was narrated from Dawood that he said: I said to Sa'eed ibn al-Musayyab: O Abu Muhammad, who will have the reward, the one who performs Hajj or the one on whose behalf he performs Hajj? Sa'eed said: Allah, may He be exalted, so generous that He will reward both abundantly. Ibn Hazm said: Sa'eed (may Allah have mercy on him) is right.

End quote from al-Muhalla (7/61)

Shaykh Muhammad ibn Ibraaheem Aal ash-Shaykh (may Allah have mercy on him) said: The one who does Hajj on behalf of the deceased will have the reward of Hajj if he did that voluntarily (without being paid for it). Abu Dawood said in Masaa'il al-Imam Ahmad, narrating from Imam Ahmad: I heard a man say to Ahmad: I want to do Hajj on behalf of my mother; do you think that I will also have the reward of Hajj? He said: Yes, because you are paying a debt that she owes. End quote. This is the apparent meaning of what was narrated by at-Tabaraani in al-Awsat from Abu Hurayrah (may Allah be pleased with him), that the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: "Whoever does Hajj on behalf of one who has died, the one who does it will have a reward like that of the one on whose behalf he did Hajj. Whoever gives food to one who is fasting with which to break his fast will have a reward like his, and whoever calls others to do some good deed will have a reward like that of the one who does it."

End quote from Fataawa ash-Shaykh Muhammad ibn Ibraaheem Aal ash-Shaykh (5/184)

Shaykh al-Albaani (may Allah have mercy on him) classed as da'eef the hadeeth "Whoever does Hajj on behalf of one who has died, the one who does it will have a reward like that of the one on whose behalf he did Hajj"

Silsilat al-Ahaadeeth ad-Da'eefah wa'l-Mawdoo'ah

Islam Question & Answer

General Supervisor:
Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid

-2-

The second view is that the virtue or reward mentioned in the hadeeths quoted above applies only to the one on whose behalf it is done; as for the proxy, he will have a reward for his kindness towards his brother in performing the ritual on his behalf, and for whatever acts of worship he does separately from the actions of Hajj, and that he does in the Haram, such as prayer, dhikr and so on.

In Fataawa al-Lajnah ad-Daa'imah (11/77-78) it says: Whoever does Hajj or 'umrah on behalf of another person, whether that is in return for payment or otherwise, the reward of Hajj or 'Umrah will go to the person on whose behalf he did it, and there is the hope that he will also have a great reward, commensurate with his sincerity and intention to do good. End quote.

Shaykh Ibn 'Uthaymeen (may Allah have mercy on him) was asked: Will the one who does Hajj on behalf of another person attain the reward mentioned by the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him): "Whoever performs Hajj and does not commit any obscenity or commit any evil will go back (free of) sin as on the day his mother bore him"?

He replied: The answer to this question depends on whether this man is doing Hajj on his own behalf or on behalf of someone else. If he is doing Hajj on behalf of someone else and has not yet done Hajj on his own behalf, then he will not attain the reward mentioned by the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him), because he is only doing Hajj on behalf of someone else. But in sha Allah, if he intends to benefit his brother and meet his need, then Allah, may He be exalted, will reward him.

End quote from Majmoo' Fataawa ash-Shaykh Ibn 'Uthaymeen (21/34)

He (may Allah have mercy on him) also said: The reward for deeds having to do with the rituals of Hajj all goes to the one who appointed him as his proxy; as for multiplying the reward for prayers

Islam Question & Answer

General Supervisor:
Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid

and tawaaf that he does voluntarily outside of the rituals of Hajj, and reading Qur'an, that will go to the one who is doing Hajj and not to the one who appointed him to do it on his behalf.

End quote from ad-Diya' al-Laami' min al-Khutab wa'l-Jawaami' (2/478)

This issue is one concerning which there is a difference of opinion among the scholars, and the texts concerning it are not quite clear. So to be on the safe side we should say that the issue of reward is something that Allah will decide. The Fatwa Committee issued other fatwas concerning this matter and said: With regard to a man performing Hajj on behalf of another person, and whether that is like his performing Hajj on his own behalf, or is less or more than that in terms of virtue (and reward), that is something that Allah, may He be glorified, will decide.

End quote from Fataawa al-Lajnah ad-Daa'imah (11/100)

And Allah knows best.